(c) the expectations in the future?

THE MINISTER OF TEXTILES (SHRI SHANKERSINH VAGHELA): (a) NIFT imparts Fashion Business education to cater to the Professional manpower requirement of Textiles, Garments and Fashion Goods Industries for domestic as well as international market.

(b) NIFT has trained more than 10,000 graduates through its regular programs and its continuing education, outreach and customized training programs for the Industry.

(c) NIFT expects increased interface between academy and industry in future.

MATTER RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Reported resignation of a Minister from the Union Council of Ministers

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI JASWANT SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the first Volcker Finding Report first appeared on the website, if I recollect it right, on the 27th October. Between 27th October and today, almost a month and a half has passed, and, what the country has been subjected to for 45 days is not something that we would wish to live over again. I do not recollect, Sir, when a Minsiter of External Affairs has had to be subjected, or, the country has had to be subjected to the kind of indignity that the former Minsiter of external Affairs has been subjected to. It is also a matter of concern and sadness to all of us, Sir, that when this happened --- and nobody is enhanced, and it is not as if the standing or prestige of any of us who are in the field of political activism benefit from it-- the collectivity of all of us is diminished in some sense. It is saddening that all decision that had to be taken had to be taken near midnight, that they had to be taken after the kind of protest that the two Hosues of Parliament went through. This kind of protest in parliament is not a new thing. Sir, I had the honour of serving in both the Houses of Parliament for a sufficient number of terms to know that this has become a form of protest, and it has become a form of protest only when there has been absence of the grievance redressal system. There is a grievance that the Opposition had. That grievance could very easily have been answered. That is why, I say, Sir, that it is a sad event that has taken place. But, nevertheless, it is an incomplete situation because the Volcker Committee identified was, a

member of the Union cabinet, who is now no more and has offered his resignation, plus the Congress Party. Now, Sir, we witnessed, experienced and went through all kinds of statements as to what the Volcker Committee report was, whether it was CIA instigated or it was false and various other adjectives. Two inquires were established. One headed by a distinguished former member of the Foreign Service, another by an eminent and retired Chief Justice. I do not see what purpose they will continue to serve because already the Government has arrived at certain decisions with regard to a member of their own Cabinet. In a similar fashion, Sir, it is vital that the Government take appropriate action of the other entity, that is, the Congress Party. Unless the Congress Party, the President of the Congress Party, are also treated exactly in the same fashion, as they treated. ...(*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No; no. ...(*Interruptions*) No. (*Interruptions*)

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): We will not allow you to talk about the Congress Party...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति: दो मिनट के लिए बैठ जाइए, Let him finish, Let him finish. बैठिए, एक बार बैठ जाइए...(व्यवधान) Let him finish...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY (Karnataka): Sir, these words should be expunged...(*Interruptions*)

DR.T.SUBBARAMI REDDY: We will not allow you...(*Interruptions*)...

MR.CHAIRMAN: Let him finish...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY (Karnataka): In the House, without any notice, he started speaking as the Opposition Leader...(*Interruptions*)

MR.CHAIRMAN: Let him finish...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJU PARMAR (Gujarat): Sir, we request you to expunge those words ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): He should not have referred to the Congress Party president ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: It should be expunged from the record ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: We demand that these words should be expunged from the record ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, we request you ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will see to it ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: Mr. Advani was chargesheeted ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Sir, why are you keeping quiet when there is nothing ...(*Interruptions*)...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN (Kerala) : There are a number of allegations against BJP, for demolition of Babri Masjid, yet, did your President resign? ...(*Interruptions*)... Why did you mention the Congress President here? ...(*Interruptions*)...

डा॰ कुमकुम राय (बिहार): महोदय, ये हाउस न चलने देने के लिए एक नया बहाना खोज रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)। महोदय, ये जान-बूझ कर ऐसी बात कर रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)।

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: There is a Chargesheet in the court. Mr. Advani was charge-sheeted ...(*Interruptions*)...

Sir, these words should be expunged ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will see the record ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: Why Mr. Advani did not resign? He should have resigned. ...(*Interruptions*)...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: It should be expunged from the record. As per the rules, he cannot mention a person who is not a Member of this House. It should be expunged from the record. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री राजू परमार: सर, क्या आपने एक्सपंज किया?

श्री सभापति: प्रोसीडिंग देखनी पड़ेगी क्योंकि कई लोगों के नाम लिए गए हैं। मैं प्रोसीडिंग देख लेता हूं, फिर बताउंगा।

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: Okay, thank you, Sir.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I have used the name of a political party which is today part of the ruling arrangement. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: But, you are talking about the political leader ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I do not know since when the name 'congress Party' has become an unparliamentary word.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: No, You have stated, 'Congress Party President' ...*(Interruptions)*...Mr. Chairman, Sir, please go through the record. He has stated 'Congress Party President' ...*(Interruptions)*... You did say this.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I know that there are ....*(Interruptions)*...

If they do not agree with me, Sir...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: He said, 'Congress Party President' ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: And, it cannot be permitted under the rules also. Has he given any notice that the Leader of Opposition will make a reference to the Congress President? If no, that is unacceptable. It should be expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Sir, I am on a point of order.

श्री सभापति: वह देख लिया है पोइंट आफ आर्डर। ...(व्यवधान) इसलिए मैं प्रोसिडिंग्स को देखूंगा। ...(व्यवधान)

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Under Rule 238A, it has been said, "No allegation ....*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया (झारखंड): सर, ये वाइस चेयरमैन के पैनल में हैं और आपका कहना नहीं मान रहे हैं। ये वाइस चेयरमैन हैं। ...(व्यवधान) सर, ये आपको रूल बुक दिखला रहे हैं।

He knows the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... इनको कहिए बैठने के लिए। ...(व्यवधान)

The Vice-Chairman is showing Rule Book to the Chairman. ....*(Interruptions)*...Sit down ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: As a Member, he has every right to raise any point of order. He has a right to raise a point of order. ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: He is a good Professor ...*(Interruptions)*... in his own right and for very long a very dear friend of mine. ...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Sir, Are you allowing what Shri Ahluwaliaji has said to go on record? ...*(Interruptions)*... The Member has made allegations against me. Are you allowing it to go one record? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: He is a dear friend of mine for a long time. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is going through these motions for demonstration.

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Sir, what Shri Ahluwalia has said, are you allowing it to go on record? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: What is unparliamentary that I said? What is unparliamentary? Are you not a Vice-Chairman? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is unparliamentary about it?...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Sir, are you allowing my point of order? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : Sir, I am on a point of order.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, this is a phenomena ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, Prof. P.J. Kurian wants to raise a point of order. He may be in the panel of Vice-Chairmen. But basically he is a Member of this Hosue. He has got every right to raise a point of order. How can Mr. Ahluwalia make an allegation? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: मैंने नहीं रोका है। ...(व्यवधान) बैठिए-बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He has made an allegation against Prof. P.J. Kurian ...*(Interruptions)*... It cannot be allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...It is an allegation against a Member. ...*(Interruptions)*... A Member can't make an allegation against another Member of Parliament ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, you are the custodian of this House. Your have to protect the interest of the Members of this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... why a Member is making an allegation against another Member? He is Saying that 'you are teaching the rule to the hon. Chairman.' Why should he say that? He has no right to say all this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: अब आप बैठिए, बैठ जाइए। जो कुछ भी हुआ है मैं उसको देख लूंगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Permission from Shri Narayanasamy? ...(*Interruptions*)...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: As a humble Member of this House, I am only raising a point for which I have got every right ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति: वे वाइस चेयरमैन के पैनल में हैं। उनकी प्रतिष्ठा रखने की जिम्मेदारी मेरी भी है। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: सर, आपने बोलने की परमिशन नेता प्रतिपक्ष को दी है ...(व्यवधान) उधर से खड़े होकर कोई भी बोल जाता है। ...(व्यवधान)...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Sir, are you allowing my point of order? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति: अब आप बैठिए, बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान) आप बैठिए, rest assured.

PROF. P.J. KURIAN: Okay; I will obey you. I will obey you.

श्री सभापति: आप बोलिए।

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, this is what I wanted to say. This House is for holding different views. If we didn't hold different views, we would all be in one collective party. Because we hold different views, therefore, we express different views. And this phenomena that we have witnessed, I could give it various names. It is difficult to find a word for collective hysteria. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री जनार्दन द्विवेदी: (राष्ट्रीय राजधानी क्षेत्र, दिल्ली) यह पालिटिकल फिलासफी सिर्फ दूसरों पर लागू नहीं होती, आपकी पार्टी पर भी लागू होती है। ...(व्यवधान)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: They are most accommodative of the Opposition's viewpoint, Sir ...(*Interruptions*)... It is the Opposition that is not accommodative of their viewpoints. The Houses of Parliament are for this purpose. We do have a viewpoint to express. This attitude that 'we will not accept what you say' is actually a part of the absence of grievance redressal. Very easily you could have said that you do not agree withwhat I say. After all, hon. Pranab Mukjerjee is here; we have worked together for many years. He is far more able, in Parliamentary terms, to refute what I say, than the collectivity. What am I saying, Sir? I am saying that in the Volcker Report that came out, was the name of an hon.. Member, who

was formerly in the Union Cabinet and since last evening he is not in the Union Cabinet ...(*Interruptions*)... I will not repeat what I have said, Sir, but in the Volcker Committee Report, is also contained the name of the Congress party. ...(*Interruptions*)... and, because the name of the Congress Party is contained, it is important that to settle this matter, to finally set it at rest, a complete investigation is carried out ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: It is going on ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: That is precisely what has been ordered. Now, unless that is done, this issue will not end. After all, when the hon. Prime Minister made the statement, that he did here the other day, we expressed dissatisfaction. All that I wanted to ask him that day was, not any explanation, not any clarification, but simply a confirmation, a comment, on what he had said, becuase that right to clarification of what the hon. Prime Minister had had said is still with the Opposition. We will still seek a clarification; we will still seek a debate on the Volcker Committee Report. That is all that I was saying! I do not understand the hysterical agitation that the Ruling establishment, the Ruling arrangement, went through ...(Interruptions)... It was not necessary at all. In one line, they could have said, 'we do not agree'; and we could have also said, 'we do not agree'. It is this kind of impasse that has resulted from a United Nation's report which came on the 27th of October, and for 45 days the country has been subjected to this kind of a behaviour ...(*Interruptions*)... I do not ...(*Interruptions*)...

I recollect, Sir, hon. Pranab Mukherjee, who is now in the other House, in the very last Parliament, if I am not mistaken, led an agitation for about ten days, in this very House, preventing work. On so many earlier occasions, they have demonostrated their ability to prevent work! I don't think it is necessary for the Ruling arrangement to demonstrate how not to work, as they did just now, by barracking me! That is not necessary at all! You are the majority. We must be able to say what we have to say. And it is because we were prevented from saying what we had to say, that all this resulted...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: That is wrong. You wanted to stop the functioning of the House...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I have to say that we have to have a debate...(*Interruptions*)... We must have a full-fledged debate...(*Interruptions*)... We must have our right to find a sufficient explanation and seek clarifications from the hon. Prime Minister ...(*Interruptions*)... Unless that full debate takes place, this issue will not end. That is what I am saying...(*Interruptions*)...

The Congress Party will have to be looked into. And when the Congress party's activites are looked into, naturally, the Congress Party's President will be asked. What is wrong with that, Sir? ...(*Interruptions*)... If that agitates them, then they could say, 'we won't do it'! That is all that I wanted to say. Thank you Sir...(*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I was listening to the observations made by the hon. Leader of the Opposition. I hope, now he has corrected this fact actually it is not correct that the Volcker Committee Report mentioned the name of Shrimati Sonia Gandhi anywhere. There were two entities. One entity was Mr. Natwar Singh and the other entity was the Congress Party. And it has been pointed out umpteen number of times that the Congress party is a corporate body; it is not represented or it is not just personified in one individual...(*Interruptions*)... Hon. Jashwant Singhji has stated that they had to agitate for 45 days. Sir, a detailed discussion, an exhaustive debate, has taken place on the floor of this House.

Chronologically, Mr. Chidambaram, Mr. Kapil Sibal and other Members, even Mr. Arun Jaitely, who initiated the debate under 176, elaborated the events. This is a Government which, respectfully I would like to submit, within 10 days clearly demonstrated that they would like to go to the bottom of the truth. An enquiry authority has been set up under the Commissions of Inquiry Act under Section 11 in order to obtain the materials from the United Nations. An expert was appointed and materials have been received.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Why was FIR?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am coming to that. Have little patience. I am coming to FIR ...(*Interruptions*)... Those materials have been analysed. A large number of documents are in Arabic. It takes little time to get it translated. All these exercises have been done. Therefore, I most

respectfully submit that the allegation or the accusation, which the hon. Leader of the Opposition is bringing, is not correct. The Government took action promptly. We must allow time for Justice to be done But simply it reminds me of the story in the Alice in Wonderland that I am the prosecutor; I am the judge and I am the hangman. Therefore, certain names, certain entities have appeared. Mr. Natwar Singh has resigned, not because he is found guilty. I strongly refute. He is not found guilty. ...(*Interruptions*)... It is yet to be ascertained. ...(*Interruptions*)... It is yet to be ascertained by scrutinising the documents. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar) Why is he removed from the Steering Committee? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री रूद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा): स्टीयरिंग कमेटी से क्यों हटा दिया? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad, it is not fair...(*Interruptions*) ... It is not fair. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please allow me...(*Interruptions*)... Therefore, it is not correct to say that we have accused Mr. Natwar Singh unless it is eatablished from the observations of the enquiry authority that somebody is guilty. Then, naturally the law will take its own course of action. Most respectfully, I would like to submit through you to the leader of the Opposition when a gentleman, president of a Party, was found taking money in the camera, did anybody say ...(*Interruptions*)... did anybody say ...(*Interruptions*)... that the entire party is to be accused? ...(*Interruptions*)... Did anybody say that the Prime Minister is to resign? ...(*Interruptions*)... Did anybody say that the Leader of the House, belonging to that Party, is to resign? ...(*Interruptions*)... What is said or what is demanded is that the individual concerned who was found taking money in camera, action should be taken against him...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री रूद्रनारायण पाणि: उन्होंनें चन्द मिनटों में त्याग पत्र दिया था ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: So far as the action of the Government is concerned, it is perfectly in tune with the law; it is perfectly in tune with the tradition and what Mr. Natwar Singh has done is fully justified if he says that because of the ..(*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: The conduct of ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am sure that he is not going to explain

his conduct as a party man. ...*(Interruptions)*... and should I run my party by advice of Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad or the followers of BJP? I am a man belonging to the party. I know how to conduct the party functions. I am doing it for the last three decades and I will continue till I need. So, don't advise me on that matter for I am talking as the representative of the Government and the Government has never stated that Mr. Natwar singh is guilty. Whatever Mr. Natwar Singh has said it is absolutely correct, when he found that the Opposition is demanding that unless he resigns this House will not function, simply to concede to this illogical, irrational demand of the Opposition, Mr.Natwar Singh had to resign, and we have to concede to the irrational demand of the Opposition. Thank you, Sir.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (उत्तरांचल): सभापति जी, इस जवाब से हम ...(व्यवधान)... इसलिए वाकॅआउट ...(व्यवधान)...

(तत्पश्चात कुछ माननीय सदस्यों ने सदन त्याग किया।)

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

I. **Report and Accounts (2004-2005) of the Bharat Earth Movers Limited, Bangalore and related papers**

II. **Report and Accounts (2004-2005) of Mishra Dhatu Nigam Limited, Hyderabad and related papers**

III. **Report and Accounts (2004-2005) of the Goa Shipyard Limited, Vasco-da- Gama, Goa, and related papers**

IV. **Report and Accounts (2004-2005) of the Bharat Dynamics Limited, Hyderabad and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Sir I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of section 619 A of the Companies Act, 1956:

I. (a) Forty-first Annual Report and Accounts of the Bharat Earth Movers Limited (BEML), Bangalore, for the year 2004-2005, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 29981/05]